

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA  
ASHEVILLE DIVISION**

JOHN P. MIALL, JR., ROBYN HITE,  
DAVID SHAW, DANIE JOHNSON, and  
WILLA GRANT,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CITY OF ASHEVILLE,  
DEBRA CAMPBELL, in her official  
capacity as City Manager of the City of  
Asheville, and  
ESTHER MANHEIMER, in her official  
capacity as Mayor of the City of Asheville,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:23-cv-00259-MR-WCM

**PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR  
CLASS CERTIFICATION**

Pursuant to Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Plaintiffs John Miall; Robyn Hite; David Shaw; Danie Johnson; and Willa Grant hereby move for class certification under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(b)(2). The proposed class will be represented by Plaintiffs John Miall; Robyn Hite; David Shaw; Danie Johnson; and Willa Grant (Plaintiffs). The proposed class consists of all past, present, future, and deterred nonminority Asheville or Buncombe County applicants to the Human Relations Commission of Asheville (HRCA) that are qualified to apply and compete for an appointment to the HRCA.

In support of the relief sought herein, Plaintiffs refer this Court to the Memorandum in Support of Class Certification, filed in conjunction with this motion. As more fully discussed in that Memorandum, class certification is warranted because all the requirements for class certification under Rule 23 are met. This Court should grant Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification.

DATED: October 6, 2023.

Respectfully submitted,

Ruth C. Smith  
N.C. Bar No. 26754  
The Elmore and Smith Law Firm, P.C.  
79 Woodfin Place, Suite 103  
Asheville, NC 28801  
Tel.: (828) 367-7998  
Fax: (828) 367-7991  
ruth@mywncattorney.com

/s/ Jessica L. Thompson  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Jessica L. Thompson  
N.C. Bar No. 48112  
Pacific Legal Foundation  
3100 Clarendon Blvd., Suite 1000  
Arlington, VA 22201  
Tel.: (202) 888-6881  
Fax: (916) 419-7747  
JLThompson@pacificlegal.org

Andrew Quinio\*  
Cal. Bar. No. 288101  
Pacific Legal Foundation  
555 Capitol Mall, Suite 1290  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Tel.: (916) 419-7111  
Fax: (916) 419-7747  
AQuinio@pacificlegal.org

*\*Pro Hac Vice*

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**CERTIFICATE OF CONFERRAL PURSUANT TO LOCAL RULE 7.1(b)**

Undersigned counsel certifies that counsel for Plaintiffs met and conferred in good faith with counsel for Defendants to resolve or narrow the issue.

DATED: October 6, 2023.

/s/ Jessica L. Thompson  
Jessica L. Thompson

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on October 6, 2023, I electronically transmitted the foregoing document to the Clerk of Court using the ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following:

Eric P. Edgerton  
City of Asheville  
7 Carraway Street  
Woodfin, NC 28804  
eedgerton@ashevillenc.gov  
*Counsel for Defendants*

/s/ Jessica L. Thompson  
Jessica L. Thompson